RICHARD L. BOWEN + ASSOCIATES INC.

Memorandum

216.491.9300

FAX.491.8053

13000 SHAKER BLVD

CLEVELAND, OHIO 44120

To: Mayor Robert M. Weger

From: Daniel J. Collins, P.E., Assistant City Engineer DJC

CC: Members of City Council
Frank Brichacek, Director of Finance
Thomas G. Lobe, Director of Law
Nate Catania, Streets Superintendent
Pietro A. DiFranco, P.E., City Engineer

Date: 5/30/2013

Re: Maplegrove Road Pavement Improvements
(*Ohio Public Works Commission Project No. CGX24*)

Recommendation of Contract Award

The bid opening for the Maplegrove Road Pavement Improvements Project occurred on Thursday, May 23, 2013 at 11:00am at City Hall in Council Chambers. The City received three (3) bids. The following is a summary of the official results of the bids submitted:

Contractor	BID AMOUNT
1.) Ronyak Paving, Inc.	$ 152,568.14
2.) Specialized Construction, Inc.	$ 158,939.28
3.) Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	$ 147,728.88
Engineer's Opinion of Probable Cost For Construction:	*$ 169,894.80*

After extensive review and verification of the submitted bids, Richard L. Bowen + Associates, Inc. recommends **Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.**, who is qualified to perform the work, the award of the lowest and best Bid of **$ 147,728.88**. I have received verbal notice on May 29, 2013 that the "Notice to Proceed" from the OPWC is forthcoming.

ARCHITECTS

Attached is the *"Auditor of State – Unresolved Findings for Recovery Certified Search"* for Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc. and the actual Bid Proposal Sheets ("BP-1" thru "BP-6").

ENGINEERS

Finally, attached to this Memo, is the complete *"Official" Bid Tabulation for the Maplegrove Road Pavement Improvements Project.*

CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT

Attachments (3)

Certified Search for Unresolved Findings for Recovery

Dave Yost
Ohio Auditor of State

Office of Auditor of State
88 East Broad Street
Post Office Box 1140
Columbus, OH 43216-1140
(614) 466-4514
(800) 282-0370

Auditor of State - Unresolved Findings for Recovery Certified Search

I have searched The Auditor of State's unresolved findings for recovery database using the following criteria:

Contractor's Information:

Name: Latarski, Robert
Organization: Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.
Date: 05/29/2013

This search produced the following list of possible matches:

45 Possible matches were found

Name/Organization	Address
Campbell, Robert	199 Portsmouth St. Jackson, OH 45640
Campbell, Robert	199 Portsmouth St. Jackson, OH 45640
Cannon, Jr., Robert	9038 Bedford Court Dayton, OH 45426
Cowman, Robert	2822 State Route 180 Kingston, OH 45644
Ebie, Robert	3141 Congress Lake Road Mogadore, OH 44260
Gullette, Robert	
Haff, Robert	27400 Norris Rd. Tippecanoe, OH 44699
Haney, Robert	32060 Moravian Trail Road Tippecanoe, OH 44699
Henley, Robert	, OH
Hupp, Robert	
Kendall, Robert	1801 E. 9th St. Cleveland, OH 44114

Laricela, Robert	2961 Ridgeline Trail Stow, OH 44224
Liff, Robert	13853 Era Rd. Mt. Sterling, OH 43143
Maurer, Robert	5850 Mercer Road Rockford, OH 45882
Moore, Robert	5979 Section Line Road Caledonia, OH 43314
Owen, Robert	13 Forestdale Avenue Fairborn, OH 45324
Owens, Robert	13 Forestdale Avenue Fairborn, OH 45324
Pattison, Robert	505 Clearmount, SE North Canton, OH 44720
Robinson, Roberta	100 East Siebenthaler Avenue Dayton, OH 45405
Sayre, Robert	P.O. Box 254 Jacksonville, OH 45740
Steigenwald, Robert	4248 Loubell Lane Cincinnati, OH 45205
Steigerwald, Robert	4248 Loubell Lane Cincinnati, OH 45205
Weber, Robert	P.O. Box 136 Ottoville, OH 45876-0136
Welch, Robert	419 Jacobs St. Ashland, OH 44805
Cardwell, Perry	47 1/2 Mitchell Street Jackson, OH 45640
Carnahan, Dean	54 W. Elm St. Sabina, OH 45169
Carpenter, Berry	PO Box 69, 1580 State Route 56 London, OH 43140
Carpenter, Wanda	2008 Twp. Rd. 223 Scottown, OH 45678
Carr, James	9 Schubert Drive Olmsted Township, OH 44138
Carter, Franklin	169 Brook Valley Dr. Elyria, OH 44035
Carter, Franklin	169 Brook Valley Drive Elyria, OH 44035
Carter, Franklin	7601 Harrison Avenue Mt. Healthy, OH 45231
Carter, Franklin	561 Termes Avenue Elyria, OH 44035
Carter, Franklin	61 Temes Ave Elyria, OH 44035
Carter, Franklin	600 Delaware Avenue Elyria, OH 44035
George Washington Carver Preparatory Academy	11260 Chester Road, Suite 260 Cincinnati, OH 45246
George Washington Carver Preparatory Academy	2283 Sunbury Road Columbus, OH 43219
Just Right Carpentry, LLC	8537 Shuman Lane Cincinnati, OH 45231
McCarron, John	3567 Amoy-Ganges Road Mansfield, OH 44903
McFarren, Robin	213 Greenbriar Lane Dalton, OH 44618
Ministerial Day Care Association	, OH
Ministerial Day Care Association	11955 Shaker Blvd. Cleveland, OH 44120
Slater, Jackie	
Vintage Coins and Cards AKA Vintage Coins and Collectibles	
Whitlatch, Deborah	770 Ash Street Middleport, OH 45760

The above list represents possible matches for the search criteria you entered. Please note that pursuant to ORC 9.24, only the person (which includes an organization) actually named in the finding for recovery is prohibited from being awarded a contract.

If the person you are searching for appears on this list, it means that the person has one or more findings

for recovery and is prohibited from being awarded a contract described in ORC 9.24, unless one of the exceptions in that section apply.

If the person you are searching for does not appear on this list, an initialed copy of this page can serve as documentation of your compliance with ORC 9.24(E).

Please note that pursuant to ORC 9.24, it is the responsibility of the public office to verify that a person to whom it plans to award a contract does not appear in the Auditor of State s database. The Auditor of State s office is not responsible for inaccurate search results caused by user error or other circumstances beyond the Auditor of State s control.

(RETURN THIS WITH COMPLETE SPECIFICATION BOOK)

CITY OF WILLOUGHBY HILLS

BID PROPOSAL

FOR THE

MAPLEGROVE ROAD PAVEMENT IMPROVEMENTS

IN THE CITY OF WILLOUGHBY HILLS, COUNTY OF LAKE, STATE OF OHIO

Upon acceptance of this Proposal it shall become part of the Contract.

The UNDERSIGNED, as Bidder, declares, that he has or they have carefully examined the site of Work and the Form of Contract, together with the Specifications, Plans and Profiles for the above named improvement, and that he or they will contract to provide all necessary labor, machinery, tools and appliances and other means for the construction, and do all work called for by said contract and said specifications, plans and profiles and furnish all materials called for in the bill of quantities, contract, plans and specifications in the manner therein prescribed and according to the requirements of the City Engineer as therein provided or to furnish material only or labor and equipment only, or both, as the City Engineer may decide, and to complete the Work in its entirety within sixty (60) calendar days after receipt of written notice from the Engineer to begin work, upon the following terms and for the following prices:

TOTAL BID PRICE: $ 147,728.88

BID PROPOSAL (*Continued:..*)

A. Any additional work or changes to the work of this contract shall be paid for as stated in item entitled "Changes in the Work", paragraph 31 of the General Conditions. (Contractor hereby states that if additional work is paid for as outlines under paragraph 31-c-3, his percentage of cost to cover profit and general overhead expenses will be as outlined in the General Conditions.

B. It is understood and agreed that work embodied in this Contract, together with the Alternate thereto, if any, shall be completed within sixty (60) consecutive calendar days from the date of entering into the Contract thereto, or no later September 1, 2013.

C. The undersigned agrees that if he be awarded the Contract, he will within five (5) days after being notified thereof, enter into a written contract with the City of Willoughby Hills, Ohio to furnish the labor and materials all as specified for the prices provided for in said proposal.

D. The bidder is submitted his bid, accepts the understanding that the City of Willoughby Hills reserves the right to reject any or all bids and to waive any or all irregularities and formalities. The bidder also agrees that the bid may not be withdrawn for a period of thirty (30) days after opening of bids.

E. Any combination of the various Alternates may be incorporated by the City.

F. The undersigned shall furnish a Guaranty Bond in an amount equal to ten percent (10%) for the final total contract amount in place. Such bond paid for by the undersigned shall be on a form equal to the one included as attached.

BID PROPOSAL (*Continued...*)

The undersigned Bidder deposits with this Proposal a certified check on a solvent bank in Lake County, Ohio or Bid Bond in an amount of $ 100% ,

the same being payable to the City of Willoughby Hills.

Bidder acknowledges the following Addendum Numbers: NONE

dated, respectively: _____

Executed at Solon (City) Ohio (State)

this 23rd day of May, 2013.

By _____ (Signature) Robert A. Lotarski

Title President
(Indicate: Owner, Partner, Corporation Officer, Etc.

For: Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.
(Company Name)

7615 Bond Street
(Address)

Solon (City) OH (State) 44139 (Zip)

440-439-6464
(Telephone Number)

Note: On any accompanying bid bond, the Bidder must show the full mailing address for the company acting as surety, and the full name, mailing address, and telephone number of the office, business, or agency actually issuing the bond.

BID FORM

TO: City of Willoughby Hills, Lake County, Ohio

FOR: Maplegrove Road Pavement Improvements
(OPWC Project Control No. CD024)

Abbreviations:
C.Y. - CUBIC YARD
EA. - EACH
L.F. - LINEAL FEET
L.S. - LUMP SUM
Gal. - GALLON
S.F. - SQUARE FEET
S.Y. - SQUARE YARD
MI. - MILE
LBS. - POUNDS

Schedule of Quantities (Pages BP-4, BP-5, and BP-6)

ITEM NO.	CODE NO.	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	LABOR UNIT PRICE	MATERIAL UNIT PRICE	TOTAL UNIT PRICE	TOTAL UNIT PRICE (WORDS)	TOTAL
1	SPCL	Pre-Construction Site Video on DVD, SPCL	1	L.S.	500.00	-	500.00	Five hundred dollars 00/100	500.00
2	624	Mobilization	1	L.S.	8,650.00	-	8,650.00	Eight thousand, six hundred fifty dollars and 00/100	8,650.00
3	202	Excavation and Removal of Existing Pavement & Base (18" Deep Removal), Incl. ODOT 204 Subgrade Compaction & Proof Rolling	1,622	S.Y.	10.00	-	10.00	Ten dollars and 00/100	16,220.00
4	209	Undercut Unsuitable Subgrade and Backfill with Compacted 204 Material* (assumed 50%)	243	C.Y.	5.00	40.00	45.00	Forty-five dollars 00/100	10,935.00
5	448	Asphalt Concrete Surface Course, Type 1, PG64-22, Per Plan	61	C.Y.	55.00	120.00	175.00	One hundred seventy-five dollars 00/100	10,675.00
6	448	Asphalt Concrete Intermediate Course, Type 2 PG64-22, Per Plan	84	C.Y.	34.00	110.00	144.00	One hundred forty-four dollars 00/100	12,096.00
7	407	Tack Coat for Intermediate Course, 0.05 gal per S.Y., Per Plan	82	Gal.	0.25	2.00	2.25	Two dollars 25/100	184.50
8	301	Asphalt Concrete Base, Per Plan	270	C.Y.	40.00	100.00	140.00	One hundred forty dollars 00/100	37,800.00

*Indicates contingency quantity

ORDINANCE NO. 2013-26
Exhibit "A"
Page 8 of 11

Schedule of Quantities (Continued)

ITEM NO.	SDDT #D.	DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	LABOR UNIT PRICE	MATERIAL UNIT PRICE	TOTAL UNIT PRICE	TOTAL UNIT PRICE (WORDS)	TOTAL
9	304	Aggregate Base, Per Plan	270	C.Y.	5.00	40.00	45.00	Forty-five dollars 00/100	12,150.00
10	408	Prime Coat, 0.40 gal per S.Y., Per Plan	650	Gal.	0.25	3.00	3.25	Three dollars 25/100	2,112.50
11	605	4" Shallow Pipe Underdrain with Fabric Wrap, Complete, Per Plan	1,216	L.F.	8.50	1.50	10.00	Ten dollars 00/100	12,160.00
12	646	4" Centerline, Double Solid, Yellow, Epoxy	0.12	MI.	3,600.00	6,000.00	9,600.00	Nine thousand, five hundred dollars 00/100	1,140.00
13	646	4" Edge Line, White, Epoxy	0.24	MI.	1,700.00	4,500.00	6,200.00	Six thousand, two hundred dollars 00/100	1,488.00
14	614	Maintaining Traffic, Incl. Detour Plan Implementation	1	L.S.	4,500.00	—	4,500.00	Four thousand, five hundred dollars 00/100	4,500.00
*15	614	Asphalt Concrete for Maintaining Traffic*	5	C.Y.	10.00	90.00	100.00	One hundred dollars 00/100	500.00
16	623	Construction Layout Staking	1	L.S.	1,500.00	—	1,500.00	One thousand, five hundred dollars 00/100	1,500.00
17	630	Project Sign, Flat Sheet with Ground Mounted Sign Support, furnished and installed, Complete	1	EA.	300.00	275.00	575.00	Five hundred seventy-five dollars 00/100	575.00

*Indicates contingency quantity

ORDINANCE NO. 2013-26
Exhibit "A"
Page 9 of 11

Schedule of Quantities (Continued)

ITEM NO.		DESCRIPTION	QUANTITY	UNIT	LABOR UNIT PRICE	MATERIAL UNIT PRICE	TOTAL UNIT PRICE	TOTAL UNIT PRICE (WORDS)	TOTAL
18	604	Miscellaneous Metals*	500	LBS.	0.05	0.80	0.85	Eighty-five cents	425.00
19	SPCL	Miscellaneous Portland Cement Concrete, Cast In-Place*	5	C.Y.	65.00	85.00	150.00	One hundred fifty dollars 00/100	750.00
20	659	Seeding and Mulching*	135	S.Y.	4.00	1.00	5.00	Five dollars 00/100	675.00
21	659	Topsoil*	10	C.Y.	40.00	35.00	75.00	Seventy-five dollars 00/100	750.00
22	207	Temporary Sediment and Erosion Control	1	L.S.	700.00	300.00	1,000.00	One thousand dollars 00/100	1,000.00
23	SPCL	Contingency, 8% of Sum of Items 1 through 22	1	L.S.			10,942.88	Ten thousand, nine hundred forty-two dollars and 88/100	10,942.88

*Indicates contingency quantity

TOTAL CONSTRUCTION COST: $ 147,728.88
(ITEM NUMBERS 1 THRU 23)

EARLIEST CALENDAR STARTING DATE: July 1, 2013

NUMBER OF CONSECUTIVE CALENDAR DAYS TO COMPLETE PROJECT: 60

(project shall be complete no later than September 1, 2013)

REQUIRED SIGNATURE AND INFORMATION:

Signature of Bidder: _____ Date: 5/23/13

Name: Robert A. Lotarski

Address: 7615 Bond Street Phone: 440-439-6464

Solon, OH 44139 Email: BobL@Carronasphalt.com

NOTE: The Contractor shall submit the complete book of specifications and contract documents properly completed.

ORDINANCE NO. 2013-26
Exhibit "A"
Page 10 of 11

City of Willoughby Hills

MAPLEGROVE ROAD PAVEMENT IMPROVEMENTS

(Page 1 of 1)

BID TABULATION (Bid Opening on May 23, 2013 at 11:00 a.m.)

ITEM No.	ODOT No.	Description	Unit	Quant.	Engineer's Estimate		Ronyak Paving, Inc.		Specialized Construction, Inc.		Carron Asphalt Paving, Inc.	
					Unit Pr.	Total	Unit Pr.	Total	Unit Pr.	Total	Unit Pr.	Total
1	SPCL	Pre-Construction Site Video on DVD	L.S.	1	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 750.00	$ 750.00	$ 600.00	$ 600.00	$ 500.00	$ 500.00
2	624	Mobilization	L.S.	1	$ 7,500.00	$ 7,500.00	$ 8,530.00	$ 8,530.00	$ 4,000.00	$ 4,000.00	$ 8,650.00	$ 8,650.00
3	202	Excavation and Removal of Existing Pavement & Base (15" Deep Removal), Incl. ODOT 204 Subgrade Compaction & Proof Rolling	S.Y.	1,622	$ 10.00	$ 16,220.00	$ 9.00	$ 14,598.00	$ 15.00	$ 24,330.00	$ 10.00	$ 16,220.00
4	203	Undercut Unsuitable Subgrade and Backfill with Compacted #304 Material*	C.Y.	243	$ 80.00	$ 19,440.00	$ 50.00	$ 12,150.00	$ 24.00	$ 5,832.00	$ 45.00	$ 10,935.00
5	448	Asphalt Concrete Surface Course, Type 1, PC64-22, Per Plan	C.Y.	61	$ 174.00	$ 10,614.00	$ 200.00	$ 12,200.00	$ 200.00	$ 12,200.00	$ 175.00	$ 10,675.00
6	448	Asphalt Concrete Intermediate Course, Type 2 PC64-22, Per Plan	C.Y.	84	$ 162.00	$ 13,608.00	$ 160.00	$ 13,440.00	$ 200.00	$ 16,800.00	$ 144.00	$ 12,096.00
7	407	Tack Coat for Intermediate Course, 0.05 gal per S.Y., Per Plan	GAL.	82	$ 2.00	$ 164.00	$ 3.00	$ 246.00	$ 2.00	$ 164.00	$ 2.25	$ 184.50
8	301	Asphalt Concrete Base, Per Plan	C.Y.	270	$ 122.50	$ 33,075.00	$ 120.00	$ 32,400.00	$ 160.00	$ 43,200.00	$ 140.00	$ 37,800.00
9	304	Aggregate Base, Per Plan	C.Y.	270	$ 46.00	$ 12,420.00	$ 40.00	$ 10,800.00	$ 50.00	$ 13,500.00	$ 45.00	$ 12,150.00
10	408	Prime Coat, 0.40 gal per S.Y., Per Plan	GAL.	650	$ 2.50	$ 1,625.00	$ 4.00	$ 2,600.00	$ 4.00	$ 2,600.00	$ 3.25	$ 2,112.50
11	605	4" Shallow Pipe Underdrain with Fabric Wrap, Complete, Per Plan	L.F.	1,216	$ 22.50	$ 27,360.00	$ 10.30	$ 12,524.80	$ 10.00	$ 12,160.00	$ 10.00	$ 12,160.00
12	646	4" Centerline, Double Solid, Yellow, Epoxy	MI.	0.12	$ 4,500.00	$ 540.00	$ 9,500.00	$ 1,140.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 240.00	$ 9,500.00	$ 1,140.00
13	646	4" Edge Line, White, Epoxy	MI.	0.24	$ 3,600.00	$ 864.00	$ 6,200.00	$ 1,488.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 240.00	$ 6,200.00	$ 1,488.00
14	614	Maintaining Traffic, Incl. Detour Plan Implementation	L.S.	1	$ 7,000.00	$ 7,000.00	$ 12,950.00	$ 12,950.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 4,500.00	$ 4,500.00
15	614	Asphalt Concrete for Maintaining Traffic *	C.Y.	5	$ 60.00	$ 300.00	$ 150.00	$ 750.00	$ 10.00	$ 50.00	$ 100.00	$ 500.00
16	623	Construction Layout Staking	L.S.	1	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 1,200.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00	$ 1,500.00
17	630	Project Sign, Flat Sheet with Ground Mounted Sign Support, furnished and Installed, Complete	EA.	1	$ 700.00	$ 700.00	$ 575.00	$ 575.00	$ 600.00	$ 600.00	$ 575.00	$ 575.00
18	604	Miscellaneous Metals*	LBS.	500	$ 1.00	$ 500.00	$ 1.00	$ 500.00	$ 0.90	$ 450.00	$ 0.85	$ 425.00
19	SPCL	Miscellaneous Portland Cement Concrete, Cast In-Place*	C.Y.	5	$ 125.00	$ 625.00	$ 100.00	$ 500.00	$ 200.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 150.00	$ 750.00
20	659	Seeding and Mulching*	S.Y.	135	$ 3.00	$ 405.00	$ 5.00	$ 675.00	$ 20.00	$ 2,700.00	$ 5.00	$ 675.00
21	659	Topsoil*	C.Y.	10	$ 60.00	$ 600.00	$ 50.00	$ 500.00	$ 200.00	$ 2,000.00	$ 75.00	$ 750.00
22	207	Temporary Sediment and Erosion Control	L.S.	1	$ 750.00	$ 750.00	$ 750.00	$ 750.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,000.00	$ 1,000.00
23	SPCL	Contingency, 8% of Sum of Items 1 through 22	L.S.	1	-	$ 12,584.80	-	$ 11,301.34		$ 11,773.28		$ 10,942.88
		BID TOTALS:				$ 169,894.80		$ 152,568.14		$ 158,939.28		$ 147,728.88

*Indicates contingency quantity

Lowest and best bid