

City of Willoughby Hills
Planning and Zoning Commission
&
Architectural Board of Review

MEETING MINUTES
February 6, 2020

CALL TO ORDER: 7:00 P.M.

PRESENT: Chairman Tom Elliott, Vice Chairman John Lillich, Mayor Andy Gardner,
Council Representative Tanya Taylor Draper, James Shannon and Ron Lewis, Jr.

ABSENT: Jonathan Irvine

Clerk: Katherine Lloyd, Clerk

Also Present: BZA Representative Frank Cihula
City Engineer Pietro Di Franco

MOTION:

John Lillich made a motion to excuse Jonathan Irvine from tonight's meeting.

Seconded by Tanya Taylor Draper.

VOTE: 6 AYES (6-0). Motion Passes.

Jonathan Irvine is excused from tonight's meeting.

Correspondence:

- Letter dated 12/12/19 from Jay Romer, Brymma Willoughby Hills RE: Authorization Letter for PNC ATM-Application, 27297 Chardon Road, Willoughby Hills.
- Email dated 1/16/20 from City Engineer DiFranco RE: Email of 1/3/20 re-sent to PCABR members for Hearing and Final Preliminary Review on 2/6/20 for Conditional Use Permit for a Freestanding ATM at 27291 Chardon.
- Email dated 1-15-20 from Gloria Majeski RE: City Hall Roster and the City Roster - updated 01152020
- Email dated 1-24-20 from Gloria Majeski RE: City Hall Roster and the City Roster - updated 01242020
- Email dated 1/24/20 from Asst. City Engineer Trepal RE: approval - 24 FT x 24 FT Attached Garage Addition at 35155 Chardon Rd
- Email dated 1/29/20 from Asst. City Engineer Trepal RE: Approval of permanent and temporary signage for the Harvest Community Church at 36400 Maple Grove Rd.
- Email dated 1/30/20 from Asst. City Engineer Trepal RE: approval - new house at 2496 Dodd Rd
- Email dated 1/30/20 from Asst. City Engineer Trepal RE: approval - new house at 2283 Rivers Edge Dr.
- Email dated 1/30/20 from Asst. City Engineer Trepal RE: signage package for the Natural Soap Lab at 2749B S.O.M. Center Rd.

Disposition of the Minutes for the Meeting of January 16, 2020

MOTION:

Tanya Taylor Draper moved to approve the Minutes of January 16, 2020 as submitted.

Seconded by James Shannon.

VOTE: 6 AYES (6-0). Motion Passes.

Minutes of Minutes of January 16, 2020 are approved.

PUBLIC HEARING

Public Portion opened at 7:03 p.m.

No one spoke in Public Portion.

Public Portion was closed at 7:03 p.m.

1. Jay Romer

Agent/Contractor: PNC Bank Tenant, 27297 Chardon Rd.

Architect: TBD

Engineer: Ryan Balko

27291 Chardon Rd. – Conditional Use Permit for a Freestanding ATM

-- PPN: 31-A-008-0-00-026-0

Plans received by City Engineer 11/26/19

Plans reviewed by City Engineer 12/5/19

Present: Mike Rubino of GPD Group – Architect for the project.

Application for Conditional Use Permit for a PNC Freestanding ATM going in the parking lot at 27291 Chardon Road, Willoughby Hills according to Chapter 1115 Conditional Use Certificates and Similar Uses.

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to this evening's discussion by the presenters.

Owner/Representative Comments:

- Color rendition of the proposed ATM and its location in the parking lot was distributed. It is a drive up ATM.
- This is a Final hearing. We made a presentation before the Board in December, 2019. This is a follow up. We will address any other questions.

City Engineer Comments:

This is a Conditional Use Permit for a Freestanding ATM. It is considered an accessory use so a Conditional use permit is required. It conforms to all the zoning codes. It meets the setbacks. They will be providing full cut-off lighting so there will be no migration of lighting. They will put in some low landscaping to accentuate the aesthetics while keeping it a safe environment. Parking for the shopping center is sufficient. Approval is recommended.

Board Comments:

No comments.

Public Portion opened at 7:07 p.m.

No one spoke in Public Portion.

Public Portion was closed at 7:07 p.m.

PUBLIC HEARING closed at 7:07 p.m.

ARCHITECTURAL BOARD OF REVIEW

1. Keith Nickoson

Agent/Contractor: N/A

Architect: N/A

Engineer: N/A

35155 Chardon Rd. – 24 FT x 24 FT Attached Garage Addition - PPN: 31-A-011-D-00-007-0

Plans received by City Engineer 12/3/20

Plans reviewed by City Engineer 1/24/20

Present: Nilsa Carrero, Platinum Construction

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to tonight's discussion by the presenters.

Owner/Representative Comments:

- We are here on behalf of the owner, Keith Nickoson to build a 24 FT x 24 FT Attached Garage Addition to his home.
- The colors he has approved for the garage are not the same as on the house, He will be changing the siding to match the addition. The siding will be Natural Clay color. The raised steel door will be white with white corners for the garage. The vinyl window and all the garage trim will be white. Earth tone cedar shingles will match nicely with the siding he chose. Pictures of the existing house were shown. Siding is gray-bluish color. Photographs of existing house and the location where garage will be attached were shown. The window will match the garage and the house

City Engineer Comments:

None.

Board Comments:

(Elliott) This is a front load? *Correct.*

(Taylor Draper) When will construction begin? *About three weeks.* How long until completion? *Two and a half to three weeks.*

(Lewis) You are installing ½ inch drywall on the garage side of the existing house. *The fire-eating wall that is correct.*

(Lillich) Will he park a vehicle in this this garage? *He is parking one vehicle.* He has the room for 9-foot doors. *We gave him that option. He said he just wanted room for one vehicle.*

(Lillich) It looks like the trim will match the existing trim on the house. *It will be white.* The same width? *He is changing the siding and trim on the house to match the addition. The same trim and siding.*

MOTION:

John Lillich moved to approve the plans for the Addition of this 24 FT x 24 FT Garage to the existing house at 35155 Chardon Rd. as submitted.

Seconded by Tanya Taylor Draper.

VOTE: 6 AYES (6-0). **Motion Passes.**

2. Harvest Community Church

Agent/Contractor: N/A

Architect: N/A

Engineer: N/A

36400 Maple Grove Rd. – Permanent and Temporary signage - PPN: 31-A-012-D-00-032-0

Plans received by City Engineer 1/28/20

Plans reviewed by City Engineer 1/29/20

Present: Wendy Whiteli representing Harvest Church at 36400 Maple Grove Rd.
Pastor Randy Whiteli, her husband

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to this evening's discussion by the presenters.

City Engineer Comments:

This church is changing names and locations and moving into an existing church. They are replacing the signage for the new church name. There is entrance and exist signage, some wall signage and some temporary banners. We worked with applicant to make sure it all conforms to code. It all looks good. Approval is recommended. /

Owner/Representative Comments:

Maple Grove Alliance Church closed its doors on 31st December 2019 and voted to allow us to purchase the church.

Board Comments: /

(Lillich) Looking at the photographs of the existing sign and the replacement sign, what is the color of the background? *It will be concrete. The metal letters mounted on top of it are stainless steel which will be spray-painted black. The background will be concrete, not white.*

(Elliott) It will follow the arch that is in the masonry? *Yes.*

(Lewis) It is a concrete sign that you will attach through the stone? *There is existing stone that has the name of the present church engraved in it. They will fill that in and then attach the new church sign to it. It will have a tan stone look in the background with black lettering. The letters will be raised 2-3 inches off of the concrete.* /

(Shannon) What is the composition of the other signs that are raised up on the building? *They are also stainless steel. They will be removed from the church's current facility and then be installed at the new church. The "Bible Chapel" will not be attached. It will just be "Harvest" because of the name change. Is this a gray background? The color of the emblem logo will be changed from tan to gray and will be moved onto a brick background.*

(DiFranco) It will be black letters over brick? *Yes, and the logo will be more subtle.*

(Elliott) You said the sign is brushed metal and something about concrete? Where is the concrete? *The concrete is in the free standing sign will be by the road. The sign just discussed will be a wall sign that will be hanging on the church building.*

(Elliott) Is this sign coming down? *No. Where is the concrete? Now you can see the engraved letters in the concrete where it says 'Maplegrove Alliance Church'. So it actually is a stone and they will fill in the 'Maplegrove Alliance Church' letters. The stone sign will be parged.*

(Elliott) How are they adhering the parging to the stone? *We do not know. The man who does has been doing it for four years. We thought it would be sandblasted but the contractor said filling it in would look great*

(Taylor Draper) Is this Best Industries doing the work? *Yes, the metal signage.*

(Elliott) Back to the stone, the new sign will be 3 inches off of the stone. 2-3 inches. Whatever is parged on that stone will be exposed to the elements? *Yes.*

(Lillich) I imagine they will put a sealer on it. *Tom, are you concerned about exposure?*

(Elliott) It depends on the thickness of the parging. Stone is very porous. There could be problems. *I am trusting a professional to do it. They said it would look great. Is it recessed at all? A little bit. There is a chance they may not have an issue.*

(Lillich) How many entrance and exit signs are being approved? *One entrance and one exit. They come off of Maple Grove? No, Maple Hill.*

(Shannon) The temporary sign will be up 2-3 weeks? *Yes.*

MOTION:

James Shannon moved to approve the plans for the Permanent and Temporary signage for the Harvest Community Church at 36400 Maple Grove Rd. as submitted.

Seconded by John Lillich.

VOTE: 6 AYES (6-0). **Motion Passes.**

3. Talun Thomas

Agent/Contractor: TBDxz

Architect: ProBuilt Homes

Engineer: Barrington Consulting

2496 Dodd Rd – New Single Family Home - PPN: 31-A-010-F-00-005-0

Plans received by City Engineer 1/30/20

Plans reviewed by City Engineer 1/30/20

Present: Bob Myers and Brian Peterson, both representing ProBuilt Homes.

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to tonight's discussion by the presenters.

City Engineer Comments (DiFranco):

There was a previous home on the site which was torn down. This home will replace it. It conforms to all the setbacks and other zoning codes. We recommend approval.

(Shannon) Will it be built right on the same spot as the other house was? *No. They shoveled some stuff into the basement.*

Owner/Representative Comments:

The removal was a clean backfill but there is still a gravel driveway existing on the property. That will be removed when we start excavation. The house is situated well on the lot. It is using most of the space.

(Shannon) *There was a barn back there at one point.*

- The house will face Dodd and the garage will load facing Eagle but the driveway will come off of Dodd Rd

(DiFranco) *Both the house and garage face Eagle.*

(Lillich) *Is it a poured concrete foundation? Will there be a pattern on the foundation?*

- It is a poured concrete foundation with a brick pattern. *Will it be painted?* It is a different elevation. It is stone to grade all the way around for the 2-foot return. The rest of the foundation is not colored. It will be a gray concrete color. We use Eco-Seal. We spray the foundations with tar and then we install the insulation on the outside to keep the basement walls warm. We do vertical and horizontal rebar in the foundation. *I am mainly concerned about foundation.*

Board Comments:

(Lewis) On the concrete, the sill plate is treated wood? *We use treated wood.*
How do you do the insulation? The wall section shows exterior insulation coming up and out above grade. *It is below grade on the outside of the foundation. To meet the 2009 International Energy Code to insulate two feet above grade and below grade on the inside of the foundation with batt insulation. Insulation on the homes itself is cellular.*

(Elliott) On your cut-through on the stone, it says 'veneer stone applied to wall, how are you applying the stone? *We use a mesh with a weather-proof membrane behind the felt paper. That goes over the top of the tie-back then we tap-con the mesh over the top of that. We overlap it six inches so there isn't a break in the mortar. We scratch coat and apply the stone.*

(Elliott) Poly- or regular mortar? *I believe it is polymortified mortar*

(Elliott) Where do you stop the stone at grade? Do you run it down to grade? *We usually run the stone down to grade. We usually leave 3/8-inch capillary break between the grade and the stone.*

(Elliott) I would recommend two inches because the stone manufacturer veneer recommends it two inches above finished grade. There is the ability for moisture or rising damp to occur up if the stone is too close to grade which can cause serious problems

(Lewis) And then they throw mulch next to it.

We flash it a little bit differently. We put a Z-flashing where the siding meets the stone. We also apply the tie-back and we put the flex tape between where the wood / concrete transition is before the stone goes on. It's not shown on the print but we use a full tie-back system. That is part of that system. It provides an additional capillary break so the water does not get sucked back into the house.

(Elliott) With a weed screen at the bottom? *We do not put a weed screen at the bottom. You do not? No. At the bottom of the stone? We do not leave an air gap behind there. We are not using the drainage mesh. Usually we use a screen when we use the mesh. We use the mesh behind the stone to create the air space behind the actual wall structure and the stone so the water would then drain out behind the screen.*

(Elliott) You are not using the mesh. *We are not using the drainage mesh. Oh, you are talking the metal lath drainage mesh. With drainage mesh there is nowhere for the water to go.*

(Lewis) You have a fire separation between the garage and the house? *It is implied but it is not indicated.*

(Lewis) We use 5/8" in the garage and we also 5/8" in all the house ceilings between the first and second floor and test anywhere from 2-3 on the air exchanges. Most house fires do start in the garage.

(Lillich) It is a nice building and it sits on a little rise there. It will be very attractive.

(Lewis) It will be a great addition to Willoughby Hills.

(Elliott) Under your notes for masonry, you reference ASTM C90-85. *Draftsman did that. ASTM C90-85 is the 1985 Code. You should be referencing the most up-to-date Code on your drawing.*

(Lewis) Where is the septic outflow?

(DiFranco) It is in a catch basin on Dodd Rd.

MOTION:

John Lillich moved for architectural approval of the New Single Family Home at 2496 Dodd Rd. as submitted.

Seconded by Ron Lewis.

VOTE: All AYES (6-0). **Motion passes.**

4. Nick and Amy DeBaltzo
Agent/Contractor: TBD
Architect: ProBuilt Homes
Engineer: Barrington Consulting
2283 Rivers Edge Dr. – New Single Family Home - PPN: 31-A-017-C-00-020-0
Plans received by City Engineer 1/30/20
Plans reviewed by City Engineer 1/30/20

Present: Bob Myers and Brian Peterson, both representing ProBuilt Homes.
Nick DeBaltzo, owner.

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to tonight's discussion by the presenters.

City Engineer Comments (DiFranco):

This is one of the last remaining vacant parcels in the Rivers Edge subdivision. Everything conforms to Code. We recommend approval.

Owner/Representative Comments:

Included under Board Comments.

Board Comments:

The Board discussed the drawings and orientation on the drawings.

- (Lewis) This is poured concrete as well? *Yes.* Stamped brick? *Yes.* *This particular home has the same architectural stone to grade all the way around on all four sides.*
- Samples of materials and colors were shown: Tuscan Ridge color stone; siding color is charcoal stone; 5" straight lathe in Cambridge Harvard slate; white garage door; shake on the front will be the same color.
- (Lewis) Will the stone be dry-stack or will you have mortar in the joints? *This is mortared stone.* Is it the same polymodified mortar? *Yes, we do not do any dry stack on the exterior of a home.*
- (Lillich) It is an attractive house. It will be an asset

MOTION:

John Lillich moved for approval of the New Single Family Home at 2283 Rivers Edge Dr. as presented.

Seconded by Tanya Taylor Draper.

VOTE: All AYES (6-0). **Motion passes.**

5. Natural Soap Lab
Owner: 34900 Chardon LLC
Agent/Contractor: N/A
Architect: N/A
Engineer: N/A
2749B S.O.M. Center Rd. – Review A: Signage Package - PPN: 31-A- 004-0-00-022-0
Plans received by City Engineer 1/27/20
Plans reviewed by City Engineer 1/30/20

Present: Sharon Johnson, Natural Soap Lab.

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to tonight's discussion by the presenters.

Owner/Representative Comments:

The sign is already up. I am the soap maker.

City Engineer Comments (DiFranco):

- This project is Package #1A (see upper right corner of the Engineer Review). This is Natural Soap Lab signage. It is the same building as the Lobster Pot.
- We have been working with both tenants to get their signage approved. The signage for both properties is already up but no permits were pulled.
- This Package #1A conformed to Code. We recommend approval.
- All the signs from Natural Soap Lab conform to Code, except for the one sign that says 'Handmade Soap'. That one exceeds the limit. The applicant will be asking for a variance. It will be reviewed in the second package.

Board Comments:

(Shannon) Having soap signs in every window seems a bit over the top.

(Lillich) There are no regulations.

(DiFranco) We do have regulations but it does meet the Code. If you do think it is excessive, we may need to take a look at those regulations.

(Taylor Draper) How long has your business been there? *We moved in last November.*

(Shannon) What is the problem with the 'Handmade Soap' sign?

(DiFranco) It kicks it over the allowable square footage.

MOTION:

John Lillich moved for approval of the Review A: Signage Package at 2749B S.O.M. Center Rd. as presented noting that the 'Handmade Soap' sign seen from Rt. 91 is pending approval from the BZA.

Seconded by Mayor Gardner.

VOTE: All AYES (6-0). **Motion passes.**

6. Natural Soap Lab

Owner: 34900 Chardon LLC

Agent/Contractor: N/A

Architect: N/A

Engineer: N/A

2749B S.O.M. Center Rd. – Review B: Signage Package - PPN: 31-A- 004-0-00-022-0

Plans received by City Engineer 1/27/20

Plans reviewed by City Engineer 1/30/20

Present: Sharon Johnson, Natural Soap Lab.

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to tonight's discussion by the presenters.

(Elliott) We are just looking at the letters that say 'Handmade Soap' under the 'Natural Soap' sign on SOM Center. The other side of the building is okay.

City Engineer Comments (DiFranco):

This Engineer Review is Package #1B for Natural Soap Lab.

On page 1, it states that there is an allowable 5.1 square feet. That sign is 28.9 square feet. It is about 4 square feet too large. I would recommend approval contingent upon a variance being issued by the BZA.

Owner/Representative Comments:

None

Board Comments:

(Lillich) Architecturally, I think that the lettering size fits well.
(Lewis) If they were 8 inches high?
(DiFranco) It is just the size of the letters is too big.
(Lewis) I think it is good. The speed limit on the road is 40 mph.

MOTION:

John Lillich moved for approval of the Homemade Soap sign at 2749B S.O.M. Center Rd. pending a variance being granted by the BZA.
Seconded by Tanya Taylor Draper.
VOTE: All AYES (6-0). **Motion passes.**

The Architectural Board of Review portion of this meeting was closed at 7:52 p.m.

PLANNING COMMISSION

Public Portion opened at 7:53 p.m.

1.) Vicki Miller, 2857 Hayes Drive

I know that PNC Bank is closing. I am a customer. My understanding is that this is something that PNC wants to do to service the community after they leave their building. What is the location of this ATM and what businesses surround the parking lot?

Mr. DiFranco indicated on the drawings that the ATM will be located in the middle of the parking lot which is just east of the former Borally Property. He does not know what other shops are there.

Mike Rubino of GPD Group – Architect for the project showed the exhibit representation to Mrs. Miller, the audience and the Board. O'Reilly Auto Parts is on the opposite side of Chardon Rd. It is the same as the information distributed to the Board.

2.) Tanya Taylor Draper

Is there ample lighting in that parking lot?

Mr. Rubino stated that the ATM is lighted and there is also the parking lot lighting.

Public Portion was closed at 7:56 p.m.

1. Jay Romer

Agent/Contractor: PNC Bank Tenant, 27297 Chardon Rd.

Architect: TBD

Engineer: Ryan Balko

27291 Chardon Rd. – Final Review for Conditional Use Permit for a Freestanding ATM

- PPN: 31-A-008-0-00-026-0

Plans received by City Engineer 11/26/19

Plans reviewed by City Engineer 12/5/19

Present: Mike Rubino of GPD Group – Architect for the project.

A plan packet of this project was provided to each of the Commission members prior to tonight's discussion by the presenters.

Owner/Representative Comments:

We are back for Final Approval.

City Engineer Comments (DiFranco):

No comment.

Board Comments:

(Lillich) They have been here for Preliminary Review and Approval. We have talked about the lighting, parking and staging for vehicles. All those questions have been satisfied. I see no reason not to approve this Final Review for the Conditional Use Permit for the Freestanding ATM

MOTION: John Lillich moved for approval of the Conditional Use Permit for the Freestanding ATM at 27291 Chardon Rd.

Seconded by James Shannon.

VOTE: All AYES (6-0). Motion passes. /

Additional Discussion: Councilwoman Taylor Draper asked for an estimate for when the PNC Bank will be closing. Member of the audience replied that the closing is 21st of February, 2020.

The Planning Commission was closed at 7:58 p.m. /

New Business:

None

Unfinished Business:

(Lillich) One of the things we ask for and require in Willoughby Hills Homes is brick or stone above grade. We have allowed cast cement imprinted with brick to satisfy that. Last fall we let a house go through with painted concrete block. I do not think that meets the intent of what we intended architecturally with brick above grade. If it comes before me again, I will not vote to approve. If one goes through, it could be cited as precedent. I would like the opinion of the Board members.

As discussed, the concern is aesthetical and architectural. Brick or stone above grade enhances the look of the home. This has been a long-standing requirement. We have never insisted on it but we have always been able to work with the applicant. They comply because everyone else does. For the same reason we request 4-inch trim around the windows and doors. There has been some resistance but there is value down the road for them

- From a longevity standpoint, concrete block will absorb moisture different from masonry. From a durability standpoint, they will not last as long. Even painted, it will become a maintenance issue especially at grade level.
- The Board has accepted a brick panel fastened to the foundation. It is a cheaper way to go
- (Lewis) With the Energy Code, running the insulation on the outside, I have seen them come up and be exposed. Running a trimmer or mower near it tears it apart.

Mr. DiFranco is researching the question of whether it is a Planning Commission rule or regulation in the Code. He will make a report.

Mayor's Report:

- Master Plan: This is a Master Plan year. We need to have a good look at it. It has been delayed waiting for updated Census data. During this Census year, they are counting. Results do not come out immediately. Many things have changed since the last time a Master Plan happened here. We can start reviewing the old plan. Looking at nearby communities, they are doing things to help with economic development with the types of zones they are providing.

Board Response: It has already been on our mind. We have had discussions about it. Mr. Lillich recommended that City Council supply the Board with a professional planner to work with us. A couple of the Council members have agreed with that. Hopefully, Finance has some room in the budget for it.

- Recreation Commission held a meeting last night. We continue to seek volunteers. John Lillich has volunteered to lead two Nature Walks. Volunteer forms are available from the Mayor in the office. People can sign up to help with Events or suggest things that can be done to help the community. I am always willing to listen.

Building Commissioner's Report:

Mr. DiFranco located and read Section 1333.02 Covering Masonry Above Ground which says "All representations of exterior appearance filed for approval with the Architectural Board of Review pursuant to Section 5.24 of the Charter shall show masonry above ground to be covered with a brick facing or other suitable material as approved by the Board."

Discussion: It depends on what you consider a suitable material Brick and block are two different materials. One is concrete and one is clay.

Council Representative's Report (Taylor Draper):

At the last Council meeting, an owner stepped up to express concern that the City does not have, or the City needs a completion timeline for construction projects. She has seen projects that linger for months and months and it is making her property values go down.

Mr. DiFranco has heard the complaint before. The deadline for starting a project which is within 6 months of pulling the permit. We need to check to see if there is a deadline

Mayor Gardner asked that this be placed on the next Agenda under Unfinished Business. That will give Mr. DiFranco a chance to research. Perhaps some adjoining communities have that type of legislation.

Board Discussion: Contractors post a completion bond but we need to find out when that comes into effect. Most communities have a permit good for 6 months and then the project must be done with within a year. The contractor must give the date the project will be completed. Not every project is equal. The Building Department sometimes gets requests for extension of the completion date.

Chairman's Report:

No Report.

Adjournment:

John Lillich move to adjourn. Seconded by Ron Lewis. Voice vote. All in favor. **Motion Passes.**
The meeting was adjourned at 8:11 p.m. by Chairman Tom Elliott.

Respectfully Submitted:

Katherine Lloyd
Katherine Lloyd, Clerk,

[Signature]
Chairman
4/16/20
Date/Approved