Law Director
JAMES O'LEARY

Director of Finance
FRANK J. BRICHACEK, JR.

Assistant Finance Director
DAWN SNYDER

Engineer
PIETRO A. DI FRANCO, P.E., SI, LEED AP, CPESC

Building Commissioner

Safety Director
ROBERT M. WEGER

City of Willoughby Hills

35405 Chardon Road, Willoughby Hills, Ohio 44094-9195
Phone (440) 946-1234 FAX 975-3535

Robert M. Weger, Mayor

Council
NANCY E. FELLOWS
DAVID M. FIEBIG
CHRISTOPHER HALLUM
LAURA LENZ
JANET MAJKA
LAURA PIZMOHT
JOHN PLECNIK

Council Clerk
VICTORIA A. SAVAGE, CMC

Memorandum

TO:	Robert Weger	- Willoughby Hills Mayor
FROM:	Kevin Trepal, P.E. Pietro DiFranco, P.E.	- Willoughby Hills Asst. City Engineer - Willoughby Hills City Engineer
DATE:	July 19, 2019	
CC:	Frank Brichacek Mark Grubiss	- Willoughby Hills Director of Finance - Willoughby Hills Service Department Superintendent
RE:	Contractor Award Recommendation Dodd Rd Resurfacing	

Attached please find a tabulation and evaluation of bids received on 7/16/19 for the Dodd Rd Resurfacing project. Award is recommended to ***Karvo Companies, Inc.*** as the best and lowest bidder in the amount of **$567,648.68**, with the following comments:

1. The project was advertised in the News Herald on 6/28/19 and 7/5/19. Invitations to bid were distributed to ten asphalt contractors and bid documents were distributed to The Builder's Exchange and ConstructConnect planrooms. Seven contractors purchased bid documents and all seven contractors submitted bids by the 7/16/19 deadline.

2. The bid of $567,648.68 received from Karvo Companies, Inc. is 14.6% below the Engineer's Opinion of Probable Construction Cost of $664,552.00.

3. Karvo Companies, Inc. fully understands the scope of work, proposes a 90 day construction schedule, and is comfortable with their bid.

4. Karvo Companies, Inc. is a fairly large contractor that has been around for 30 years. They have over 300 employees and the equipment available to take on almost any size project.

5. Karvo Companies, Inc. completed and submitted the Responsible Contracting Questionnaire.

Feel free to contact me with any questions or comments.

City of Willoughby Hills Bid Evaluation Form

Project:
Dodd Rd Resurfacing

Date: 7/19/19
(Bid Opening Date: 7/16/19 @ 11:30 AM)

No.	Bidders	Form	Bond	BQ	NC Affidavit	DTA	Addendums	Preliminary Const. Sched.	AOS Findings for Recovery*	Bid Amount (BASE)	Bid Amount (ALT)	Earliest Start Date	Consecutive Days to Completion
1	Karvo Companies, Inc.	X	X	X	X	X	1	-	X	$567,648.68	n/a	07/16/19	90
2	Specialized Construction, Inc.	X	X	X	X	X	1	-	X	$616,492.48	n/a	09/01/19	60
3	Burton Scot Contractors LLC	X	X	X	X	X	1	X	X	$633,523.28	n/a	08/15/19	60
4	The Shelly Company	X	X	X	X	X	1	-	-	$639,441.45	n/a	09/03/19	90
5	Barbicas Construction Co.	X	X	X	X	X	1	-	-	$678,801.15	n/a	09/09/19	45
6	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	X	X	X	X	X	1	X	-	$697,104.60	n/a	08/16/19	60
7	Ronyak Paving, Inc.	X	X	X	X	X	1	-	-	$717,250.00	n/a	08/01/19	60
	Engineer's Opinion of Probable Construction Cost									$664,552.00			

* Auditor of State (AOS) Findings of Recovery confirmation only required per ORC section 9.24 for municipal projects receiving state or federal funding

Reference Checks:

1 Morgan Hornyak w/ ODOT: Karvo is working with them on a ±8 million dollar paving project in Summit County. He said it's a very difficult project with a lot of challenges to overcome. Karvo is doing a great job and he would certainly hire them again.

2 Mark Morgan w/ City of Akron: They've hired Karvo several times in recent years. Karvo generally does a good job but on larger projects it's important to secure a veteran superintendent because some of Karvo's younger superintendents aren't as experienced and don't do as good of a job. Overall, he recommends Karvo and would hire them again .

3 Dan Collins w/ City of North Royalton: He used Karvo once in the past and they had a major issue on the project. The cement stabilization subcontractor placed the subgrade at the wrong elevation. Karvo's superintentent was very inexperienced and did not notice the elevation errors prior to paving. The asphalt ended up being much thicker than planned and did not transition smoothly at the drive aprons.

Contractor Phone Interview:

I spoke to Robin Boer with Karvo on 7/17/19. He understand the scope of work and is comfortable with his bid. The bid package was complete and he doesn't foresee any issues. He hopes he's allowed to close the road for the widening, however his bid includes reducing traffic to one lane and maintain traffic.

Recommendation:

I, Kevin Trepal, P.E., Asst. City Engineer, recommend to the Mayor/Service Director award of the above referenced project to Karvo Companies, Inc., with the lowest and best bid of $567,648.68.

Subject: Bid Tab
Project: Dodd Rd Resurfacing
City: Willoughby Hills, Ohio
By: Brian Willems
Date 7/16/2019

				Dodd	ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE		Karvo Companies Inc.		Specialized Constructon Inc.		Burton Scot Contractors LLC		The Shelly Company		Barbicas Construction Co Inc.		Chagrin Valley Paving Inc.		Ronyak Paving Inc.	
			Length (FT)	8891			4524 Hudson Dr. Stow, OH 44224 330-929-9616 Karvo@Karvocompanies.com		711 Harvard Ave Cuyahoga Heights, OH 44105 216-271-3363 Estimating@specon4.com		11330 Kinsman Rd Newbury, OH 44065 440-564-1011 cpeters@burtonscot.com		8920 Canyon Falls Blvd Ste Twinsburg, OH 44087-1973 330-425-7861 Shellynequotes@shellyco.com		124 Darrow Rd Ste 1 Akron, OH 44305 330-733-9101 Estimating@barbicas.com		17290 Munn Rd Chagrin Falls, OH 44023 440-543-2253 Krjsv@Chagrinvalleypaving.com		14376 N Cheshire St. Burton, OH 44021 440-834-1988 Rich@Ronyakpaving.com	
			Width (FT)	21																
			Area (SY)-Calc	20746																
			Widening Area	247																
REF. NO.	ITEM NO.	Description	UNIT	QUANT.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL
1	SPCL	Pre & Post Construction Photography, SPCL	LS	1	$2,500.00	$2,500.00	$1,000.00	$1,000.00	$600.00	$600.00	$1,350.00	$1,350.00	$2,184.00	$2,184.00	$1,500.00	$1,500.00	$1,800.00	$1,800.00	$1,000.90	$1,000.90
2	624	Mobilization, ODOT ITEM 624	LS	1	$20,000.00	$20,000.00	$15,000.00	$15,000.00	$18,800.00	$18,800.00	$23,000.00	$23,000.00	$40,000.00	$40,000.00	$15,000.00	$15,000.00	$20,000.00	$20,000.00	$27,877.00	$27,877.00
3	254	2" Asphalt Planing with Removal & Disposal	SY	20746	$3.00	$62,238.00	$1.35	$28,007.10	$3.00	$62,238.00	$1.30	$26,969.80	$1.70	$35,268.20	$3.25	$67,424.50	$2.50	$51,865.00	$1.50	$31,119.00
4	202	Pavement Removed	SY	224	$15.00	$3,360.00	$15.00	$3,360.00	$15.00	$3,360.00	$15.00	$3,360.00	$18.00	$4,032.00	$8.00	$1,792.00	$22.00	$4,928.00	$25.00	$5,600.00
5	252	Full Depth Pavement Removal and Flexible Replacement, ODOT ITEM 252 (est. at 5%)*	SY	1038	$25.00	$25,950.00	$49.00	$50,862.00	$30.00	$31,140.00	$40.00	$41,520.00	$45.00	$46,710.00	$42.00	$43,596.00	$57.00	$59,166.00	$87.00	$90,306.00
6	251	Partial Depth Pavement Repair, min. 6" depth (est. at 10%)*	SY	2075	$30.00	$62,250.00	$21.00	$43,575.00	$11.00	$22,825.00	$25.00	$51,875.00	$20.00	$41,500.00	$20.00	$41,500.00	$37.00	$76,775.00	$46.00	$95,450.00
7	304	Aggregate Base, Including Excavation*	CY	25	$65.00	$1,625.00	$45.00	$1,125.00	$25.00	$625.00	$80.00	$2,000.00	$50.00	$1,250.00	$70.00	$1,750.00	$175.00	$4,375.00	$65.00	$1,625.00
8	611	Valve Box Adjusted to Grade*	EA	4	$250.00	$1,000.00	$540.00	$2,160.00	$50.00	$200.00	$650.00	$2,600.00	$300.00	$1,200.00	$100.00	$400.00	$500.00	$2,000.00	$575.00	$2,300.00
9	611	Valve Box Replacement, Complete in Place	EA	1	$600.00	$600.00	$700.00	$700.00	$200.00	$200.00	$1,575.00	$1,575.00	$750.00	$750.00	$295.00	$295.00	$790.00	$790.00	$750.00	$750.00
10	611	Monument Box Adjusted to Grade*	EA	1	$250.00	$250.00	$120.00	$120.00	$50.00	$50.00	$730.00	$730.00	$300.00	$300.00	$100.00	$100.00	$775.00	$775.00	$650.00	$650.00
11	611	Monument Box Replacement, Complete*	EA	1	$600.00	$600.00	$800.00	$800.00	$200.00	$200.00	$1,440.00	$1,440.00	$750.00	$750.00	$550.00	$550.00	$1,075.00	$1,075.00	$850.00	$850.00
12	611	Catch Basin Adjusted to Grade*	EA	2	$650.00	$1,300.00	$900.00	$1,800.00	$200.00	$400.00	$1,250.00	$2,500.00	$350.00	$700.00	$600.00	$1,200.00	$775.00	$1,550.00	$800.00	$1,600.00
13	611	Manhole Adjusted to Grade*	EA	1	$500.00	$500.00	$250.00	$250.00	$350.00	$350.00	$1,250.00	$1,250.00	$350.00	$350.00	$600.00	$600.00	$875.00	$875.00	$750.00	$750.00
14	611	Miscellaneous Metals	LBS	2500	$1.25	$3,125.00	$1.50	$3,750.00	$1.00	$2,500.00	$1.30	$3,250.00	$1.00	$2,500.00	$1.20	$3,000.00	$1.60	$4,000.00	$1.35	$3,375.00
15	448	Asphalt Concrete Surface Course, 1-1/4", Type 1, PG64-22	CY	721	$210.00	$151,410.00	$174.00	$125,454.00	$199.00	$143,479.00	$165.00	$118,965.00	$152.75	$110,132.75	$200.00	$144,200.00	$185.00	$133,385.00	$175.00	$126,175.00
16	407	Tack Coat Between Intermediate and Surface Courses of Asphalt, 0.05 gal per S.Y.	GAL	1038	$2.00	$2,076.00	$1.75	$1,816.50	$1.50	$1,557.00	$2.00	$2,076.00	$2.85	$2,958.30	$2.50	$2,595.00	$2.00	$2,076.00	$4.00	$4,152.00
17	448	Asphalt Concrete Intermediate Course, 1-3/4", Type 2, PG64-22	CY	1029	$155.00	$159,495.00	$131.00	$134,799.00	$160.00	$164,640.00	$135.00	$138,915.00	$122.75	$126,309.75	$150.00	$154,350.00	$140.00	$144,060.00	$130.00	$133,770.00
18	422	Pavement Interlayer ODOT ITEM 422 Chip Seal with Polymer Binder and Aggregate Modification (min. 3/8")	SY	20746	$2.50	$51,865.00	$1.70	$35,268.20	$2.75	$57,051.50	$2.00	$41,492.00	$2.20	$45,641.20	$2.00	$41,492.00	$2.00	$41,492.00	$1.85	$38,380.10
19	204	Excavation of Subgrade, Including Disposal	CY	165	$24.00	$3,960.00	$27.00	$4,455.00	$40.00	$6,600.00	$39.00	$6,435.00	$30.00	$4,950.00	$50.00	$8,250.00	$45.00	$7,425.00	$30.00	$4,950.00
20	204	Subgrade Compaction & Proof Rolling	SY	247	$1.00	$247.00	$1.00	$247.00	$1.00	$247.00	$2.00	$494.00	$1.00	$247.00	$1.00	$247.00	$3.00	$741.00	$1.00	$247.00
21	304	Aggregate Base	CY	42	$55.00	$2,310.00	$110.00	$4,620.00	$50.00	$2,100.00	$120.00	$5,040.00	$165.00	$6,930.00	$150.00	$6,300.00	$76.00	$3,192.00	$95.00	$3,990.00
22	408	Prime Coat (0.40 Gal/SY)	GAL	99	$2.50	$247.50	$8.00	$792.00	$2.00	$198.00	$4.00	$396.00	$5.00	$495.00	$6.00	$594.00	$3.50	$346.50	$4.00	$396.00
23	301	Asphalt Concrete Base, PG64-22	CY	42	$145.00	$6,090.00	$183.00	$7,686.00	$165.00	$6,930.00	$225.00	$9,450.00	$210.00	$8,820.00	$250.00	$10,500.00	$180.00	$7,560.00	$155.00	$6,510.00
24	SPCL	Roadside Restoration - Complete, incl. Cleanup, Topsoil, Fill, Grading, Linear Grading, Seeding & Mulching	LS	1	$14,500.00	$14,500.00	$16,400.00	$16,400.00	$3,500.00	$3,500.00	$20,000.00	$20,000.00	$25,000.00	$25,000.00	$12,000.00	$12,000.00	$12,000.00	$12,000.00	$13,600.00	$13,600.00
25	614	Maintaining Traffic	LS	1	$15,000.00	$15,000.00	$19,000.00	$19,000.00	$22,200.00	$22,200.00	$57,000.00	$57,000.00	$60,000.00	$60,000.00	$45,000.00	$45,000.00	$39,000.00	$39,000.00	$45,000.00	$45,000.00
26	SPCL	Asphalt Concrete for Maintaining Traffic*	CY	25	$125.00	$3,125.00	$230.00	$5,750.00	$45.00	$1,125.00	$200.00	$5,000.00	$200.00	$5,000.00	$150.00	$3,750.00	$200.00	$5,000.00	$175.00	$4,375.00
27	640	4" Double Yellow Center Line	MI	1.69	$2,000.00	$3,380.00	$1,400.00	$2,366.00	$1,475.00	$2,492.75	$1,400.00	$2,366.00	$1,475.00	$2,492.75	$2,500.00	$4,225.00	$1,550.00	$2,619.50	$1,400.00	$2,366.00
28	640	24" Stop Line, Type 2	LF	84	$7.00	$588.00	$4.00	$336.00	$3.50	$294.00	$4.00	$336.00	$3.50	$294.00	$4.00	$336.00	$3.75	$315.00	$4.00	$336.00
29	SPCL	10% Contingency*	LS	1	$59,960.00	$59,960.00	$51,149.88	$51,149.88	$55,590.23	$55,590.23	$57,138.48	$57,138.48	$57,676.50	$57,676.50	$61,254.65	$61,254.65	$62,918.60	$62,918.60	$64,750.00	$64,750.00
30	SPCL	Construction Observation (Allowance)	LS	1	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00
		TOTAL				$664,551.50		$567,648.68		$616,492.48		$633,523.28		$639,441.45		$678,801.15		$697,104.60		$717,250.00

Notes:

Mathematical Error in Submitted Bid; Corrected Value is Shown